

Archives of Neurology

Issue: Volume 58(4), April 2001, pp 678-680

Copyright: Copyright 2001 by the American Medical Association. All Rights Reserved. Applicable FARS/DFARS Restrictions Apply to Government Use. American Medical Association, 515 N. State St, Chicago, IL 60610.

Publication Type: [Letters to the Editor]

ISSN: 0003-9942<sup>L</sup> 0003-9942

Accession: 11296007

Keywords: Electroencephalography, Epilepsy, Temporal Lobe, Epilepsy, Temporal Lobe, Humans

[Letters to the Editor]

## The Requirement for Ictal EEG Recordings Prior to Temporal Lobe Epilepsy Surgery

Doherty, Colin P. MB, MRCP(I); Cole, Andrew J. MD, FRCP(C)

### Author Information

(Cole) Massachusetts General Hospital; ACC 835; Harvard Medical School; 32 Fruit St; Boston, MA 02114; (e-mail: cpdoherty@partners.org)

In the April 2000 issue of the ARCHIVES, Cendes et al [1](#) present a provocative study that suggests that in a certain highly selected subgroup of patients undergoing evaluation for temporal lobe epilepsy (TLE) surgery, one could dispense with ictal recordings before proceeding to resection. Because surgical outcome data are not provided, their claim is difficult to evaluate. Most epileptologists believe that the ictal electroencephalograph (EEG) is necessary for definitive lateralization because bilateral interictal epileptiform discharges are commonly observed in patients with strictly unilateral seizures. [2](#) However, this study is the latest in a series of reports that indicate that it is possible to define a group of patients in which the interictal information is at least as informative as the ictal recordings in terms of lateralization and, furthermore, that discordance is extremely unlikely when the information is backed up by reliable quantitative structural magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) data. [1, 3-4](#) The benefits of dispensing with ictal recordings are obvious—a reduction in the potential risks associated with the need to withdraw anticonvulsant medication, a reduction in the time of inpatient stay, and a reduction in the overall cost of the hospital visit. While these are clearly admirable goals, we feel that the results of the study of Cendes et al do not address all of the issues that require resolution before it would be prudent to do away with long-term EEG monitoring.

Spencer, [5](#) Raymond et al, [6](#) and Fish and Spencer [7](#) have pointed out that in studies of large groups of subjects, there appears to be a definite subgroup of patients who have clear unilateral mesial temporal disease on MRI, but whose seizure onset occurs elsewhere. [5-7](#) This phenomenon has become known as dual pathology and may include the coexistence of extrahippocampal neocortical disease on the ipsilateral and contralateral sides as well as bilateral hippocampal disease. [7](#) Thus, while the EEG may not be discordant in terms of lateralization, it may not be in agreement in terms of localization.

While the recent interest in the concept of dual pathology has been driven by improvements in radiological analysis, the proposition that TLE is rarely, if ever, confined to the hippocampus is a relatively old one. Impressive evidence for the widespread nature of the pathological features of TLE has come from histological analysis of both surgical and autopsy specimens. 8-12 Furthermore, early indirect radiological studies concentrated on atrophy of the whole lobe rather than just the mesial structures. 13-14 More recently, the application of functional imaging techniques, both dynamic and static, to the TLE population again supports the idea of more widespread abnormalities. 15-17

Cendes et al have clearly addressed the issue of bilateral hippocampal sclerosis through the use of quantitative hippocampal volumetry corrected for intracranial volume (the finding of 19% with bilateral hippocampal sclerosis is similar to percentages reported in previous studies 18-19). However, they do not seem to have addressed the coexistence of damage in the neocortex or of minor developmental abnormalities, such as focal cortical dysplasia.

The practical issue related to dual pathology and discordant localization is the extent of resection. The growth in popularity of the selective procedures 20 has necessitated an improvement in determining the difference between seizures of hippocampal or neocortical origin, since it has been suggested that a selective procedure in a patient with predominantly neocortical onset is likely to result in a poorer surgical outcome. 21 However, the findings of uncontrolled nonrandomized studies are in conflict over whether patients who have selective procedures with so-called neocortical-onset seizures do worse than those with mesiobasal-onset seizures. 22-23 In contrast, outcome studies in patients with MRI evidence of dual pathology are more conclusive, showing poorer outcomes in patients with bilateral hippocampal sclerosis 24-25 and in patients with coexisting dysgenic lesions. 26-28

Thus, the question remains as to whether there are reliable radiological or neurophysiological tests that Cendes and his colleagues could have applied to their patients in order to rule out coexisting extrahippocampal abnormalities. Unfortunately, in the current literature, volumetric data about the mesial structures have proliferated almost to the exclusion of the rest of the temporal lobe. 10 Although a few quantitative and semiquantitative studies of the extrahippocampal tissue have been published, these methods have not become routine because of a lack of consensus on anatomical borders, and possibly because of the fact that, on visual analysis alone, temporal atrophy may be seen as a "soft" sign. 10, 26, 28-30 Furthermore, while proton spectroscopy has provided subtle metabolic information about the lateral temporal structures, this modality has been shown to be more valuable in predicting surgical failure than success. 31-32

This brings us to the place of ictal recordings. Alving 33 has summarized the

conventional thinking about the purpose of ictal recordings, emphasizing two important issues not addressed by Cendes et al. The first concerns the need to make sure that the seizures the patient is having are, in fact, epileptic in origin in order to avoid what he called "the disaster of operating on someone with pseudoseizures." Secondly, Alving addressed the issue of focal vs regional onset. Over the last few years, several studies have shown that ictal recordings may reveal patterns that help localize seizure onset to either the mesiobasal area or the temporal neocortex. [2, 34-35](#) Thus, regardless of the convergence of lateralization between ictal and interictal recording, it seems that the scalp EEG, subject to postprocessing, may have localizing value that single interictal discharges do not have.

In conclusion, we believe that, given the importance of establishing the diagnosis of true epileptic seizures and in the absence of reliable quantitative or qualitative radiological data to assess the extrahippocampal tissue, in order to rule out dual pathology, ictal recording should remain an important adjunct to presurgical evaluation, even in the highly selected patients chosen by Cendes et al.

## References

1. Cendes F, Li LM, Watson C, Andermann F, Dubeau F, Arnold DL. Is ictal recording mandatory in temporal lobe epilepsy? not when the interictal electroencephalogram and hippocampal atrophy coincide. *Arch Neurol.* 2000;56:497-500. [\[Context Link\]](#)
2. Ebersole JS, Pacia SV. Localization of temporal lobe foci by ictal EEG patterns. *Epilepsia.* 1996;37:386-399. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
3. Cascino G, Trenerry M, So EL, et al. Routine EEG and temporal lobe epilepsy: relation to long-term EEG monitoring, quantitative MRI, and operative outcome. *Epilepsia.* 1996;37:651-656. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
4. Baumgartner C, Lindinger G, Ebner A, et al. Propagation of interictal epileptic activity in temporal lobe epilepsy. *Neurology.* 1995;45:118-122. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
5. Spencer SS. The relative contributions of MRI, SPECT, and PET imaging in epilepsy [review]. *Epilepsia.* 1994;35(suppl 6):S72-S89. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

6. Raymond A, Fish DR, Stevens J, Cook M, Sisodiya S, Shorvon S. Association of hippocampal sclerosis with cortical dysgenesis in patients with epilepsy. *Neurology*. 1994;44:1841-1845. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
7. Fish DR, Spencer SS. Clinical correlations: MRI and EEG [review]. *Magn Reson Imaging*. 1995;13:1113-1117. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
8. Margerison JH, Corsellis JA. Epilepsy and the temporal lobes: a clinical electroencephalographic and neuropathological study of the brain in epilepsy, with particular reference to the temporal lobes. *Brain*. 1966;89:499-530. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
9. Meyer A, Falconer M, Beck E. Pathological findings in temporal lobe epilepsy. *J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry*. 1954;17:276-285. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
10. Mitchell LA, Jackson GD, Kalnins RM, et al. Anterior temporal lobe abnormality in temporal lobe epilepsy: a quantitative MRI and histopathologic study. *Neurology*. 1999;52:327-336. [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
11. Bruton CJ. *The Neuropathology of Temporal Lobe Epilepsy*. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press; 1988. Russell G, Marley E, eds. Maudsley Monographs; No. 30. [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
12. Hardiman O, Burke T, Phillips J, et al. Microdysgenesis in resected temporal neocortex: incidence and clinical significance in focal epilepsy. *Neurology*. 1988;38:1041-1047. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
13. McRae D. Focal epilepsy: correlation of the pathological and radiological findings. *Radiology*. 1948;50:438-458. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)
  
14. Childe A, Penfield W. Anatomic and pneumographic studies of the temporal horn. *Arch Neurol Psychiatry*. 1937;37:1021-1034. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

predictor of seizure control after temporal lobectomy. *Neurology*. 1993;43:1088-1092. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

16. Theodore W. Positron emission tomography and single photon emission computed tomography. *Curr Opin Neurol*. 1996;9:89-92. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

17. Cendes F, Andermann F, Preul MC, Arnold DL. Lateralisation of temporal lobe epilepsy based on regional metabolic abnormalities in proton magnetic resonance spectroscopic images. *Ann Neurol*. 1994;35:211-216. [\[Context Link\]](#)

18. King D, Spencer SS, McCarthy G, Luby M, Spencer DD. Bilateral hippocampal atrophy in medial temporal lobe epilepsy. *Epilepsia*. 1995;36:905-910. [\[Context Link\]](#)

19. Quigg M, Bertram EH, Jackson T, Laws E. Volumetric magnetic resonance imaging evidence of bilateral hippocampal atrophy in mesial temporal lobe epilepsy. *Epilepsia*. 1997;38:588-594. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

20. Wieser HG, Yasargil MG. Selective amygdalohippocampectomy as a surgical treatment of mesiobasal limbic epilepsy. *Surg Neurol*. 1984;17:445-457. [\[Context Link\]](#)

21. Walczak T. Neocortical temporal lobe epilepsy: characterizing the syndrome. *Epilepsia*. 1995;36:633-635. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

22. Spencer SS, Spencer DD, Williamson PD, Mattson R. Combined depth and subdural electrode investigation in uncontrolled epilepsy. *Neurology*. 1992;40:74-79. [\[Context Link\]](#)

23. Burgerman RS, Sperling MR, French JA, Saykin AJ, O'Connor MJ. Comparison of mesial versus neocortical onset temporal lobe seizures: neurodiagnostic findings and surgical outcome. *Epilepsia*. 1995;36:662-670. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

24. Jack CR Jr, Trenerry MR, Cascino GD, Sharbrough FW, So EL, O'Brien PC. Bilaterally symmetric hippocampi and surgical outcome. *Neurology*. 1995;45:1353-1358. [MGH Full](#)

[Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

25. Barr WB, Ashtari M, Schaul N. Bilateral reductions in hippocampal volume in adults with epilepsy and a history of febrile seizures. *J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry*. 1997;63:461-467. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

26. Sisodiya SM, Moran N, Free SL, et al. Correlation of widespread preoperative magnetic resonance imaging changes with unsuccessful surgery for hippocampal sclerosis. *Ann Neurol*. 1997;41:490-496. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

27. Kuzniecky R, Ho SS, Martin R, et al. Temporal lobe developmental malformations and hippocampal sclerosis: epilepsy surgical outcome. *Neurology*. 1999;52:479-484. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

28. Sisodiya S, Free SL, Stevens JM, Fish DR, Shorvon SD. Widespread cerebral structural changes in patients with cortical dysgenesis and epilepsy. *Brain*. 1995;118:1039-1050. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

29. Marsh L, Morrell M, Shear PK, et al. Cortical and hippocampal volume deficits in temporal lobe epilepsy. *Epilepsia*. 1997;38:576-587. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

30. Jack CR Jr, Sharbrough FW, Twomey CK, et al. Temporal lobe seizures: lateralization with MR volume measurements of the hippocampal formation. *Radiology*. 1990;175:423-429. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

31. Kuzniecky R, Hugg J, Hetherington H, et al. Predictive value of 1H MRSI for outcome in temporal lobectomy. *Neurology*. 1999;53:694-698. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

32. Li LM, Cendes F, Antel S, et al. Prognostic value of proton magnetic resonance spectroscopic imaging for surgical outcome in patients with intractable temporal lobe epilepsy and bilateral hippocampal atrophy. *Ann Neurol*. 1999;47:195-200. [\[Context Link\]](#)

Acta Neurol Scand Suppl. 1994;152:5-8. [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

34. Bartolomei F, Wendling F, Vignal JP, et al. Seizures of temporal lobe epilepsy: identification of subtypes by coherence analysis using stereo-electro-encephalography. Clin Neurophysiol. 1999;110:1741-1754. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

35. Foldvary N, Lee N, Thwaites G, et al. Clinical and electrographic manifestations of lesional neocortical temporal lobe epilepsy. Neurology. 1997;49:757-763. [MGH Full Text](#) | [Check MGH for availability](#) | [MGH Ovid Full Text](#) | [Bibliographic Links](#) | [\[Context Link\]](#)

Diagnostic Techniques and Procedures; EEG; Electroencephalography; Epilepsy; Preoperative Care

Copyright (c) 2000-2013 Ovid Technologies, Inc.

[Terms of Use](#) | [Support & Training](#) | [About Us](#) | [Contact Us](#)

Version: OvidSP\_UI03.10.00.104, SourceID 59019